



**APPROVED**

**MINUTES OF THE PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
MEETING OF OCTOBER 23, 2013  
CITY OF ROCK ISLAND, ILLINOIS**

The Rock Island Preservation Commission held its regularly scheduled meeting in the City Hall Council Chambers at 1528 – 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue, Rock Island, Illinois. The meeting was called to order by Chairman Colleen Vollman at 5:32 PM. Present were Commissioners Lendol Calder, Kent Cornish, Mark McVey, John Strieter, Sue Swords, Colleen Vollman and Associate Member Diane Oestreich. Commissioner Craig Kavensky arrived at 5:39. Commissioners Brent Bogen and Italo “Lo” Milani were absent, as were Associate Members Linda Anderson, Jeff Dismer and Daryl Empen. Also in attendance were Ben Griffith and Brandy Howe.

**AN ORDER APPROVING THE WRITTEN AGENDA**

The Commission considered the matter of approval of the written agenda. It was suggested to move item #6 on the agenda after item #10. Commissioner McVey made a motion to amend the agenda by moving item #6 after item #10. Commissioner Calder seconded the motion and the Commission voted unanimously to approve the agenda as amended.

**AN ORDER APPROVING THE MINUTES OF THE MAY 29, 2013 MEETING**

The Commission considered the matter of approval of the minutes of the May 29, 2013 meeting. Commissioner McVey made a motion to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Swords seconded the motion and the Commission voted unanimously to approve said minutes as presented.

**AN ORDER APPROVING THE MINUTES OF THE AUGUST 28, 2013 MEETING**

The Commission considered the matter of approval of the minutes of the August 28, 2013 meeting. Commissioner Cornish made a motion to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Strieter seconded the motion and the Commission voted unanimously to approve said minutes as presented.

### **AN ORDER APPROVING THE MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 11, 2013 MEETING**

The Commission considered the matter of approval of the minutes of the September 11, 2013 meeting. Commissioner Calder made a motion to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Swords seconded the motion and the Commission voted unanimously to approve said minutes as presented.

### **PROCEDURAL EXPLANATION**

Chairman Vollman provided a brief explanation of the procedure for reviewing the Certificate of Appropriateness request which was on the agenda. She asked everyone who wished to address the Commission to please sign the sign-in sheet at the podium and to be sure and state their name for the record.

### **CASE #2013-9: CONSIDERATION OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR 700 – 22<sup>nd</sup> STREET, ROCK ISLAND, WHICH IS KNOWN AS THE KARPELES MUSEUM (FORMER FIRST CHURCH OF CHRIST, SCIENTIST)**

Next there came before the Commission Case #2013-9: a request by the Karpeles Museum to place two cannons onto the front yard of the museum grounds. Chairman Vollman stated that everyone should be familiar with the recent requests of the Karpeles Museum and asked the applicant to step forward to address the Commission. Mr. John Snow of the Karpeles Museum stepped forward and stated that Dr. Karpeles is seeking a pair of cannons for the grounds and was seeking a blanket approval since he did not know what would be available on the market, adding that it changes quickly and the timeliness issue was always a factor in his purchasing. He was seeking approval to place two cannons on the grounds with the idea that they would be old and have historic value. The cannons would be restored and would be mounted on concrete slabs and anchored in place with steel rebar.

The Commissioners discussed the pros and cons of displaying two cannons in front of what had previously been a church and the types of cannons which would be on display. Mr. Snow stated that Dr. Karpeles wanted to display cannons at the museum due to ties with the Arsenal Museum, adding that the Karpeles Museum in Washington was a former VFW and it too had cannons displayed on its grounds. There was further discussion about the age of the cannons which would give them historic value.

After further discussion, Commissioner Cornish made a motion to approve the request to place two cannons on display at the grounds of the Karpeles Museum, so long as the phrase “manufactured before 1945” was added to the text of the Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion as seconded by Commissioner McVey and the Commission voted unanimously in favor of the request.

### **UPDATE ON PUBLIC LIBRARY CHIMNEY PROJECT**

Next there came before the Commission an update on the chimney project at the Rock Island Public Library. Director Angela Campbell and Pat Frey of Otto Baum Construction stepped forward to address the Commissioners. Mr. Frey explained the progress of the work and stated that although he originally intended to use the existing stone blocks, he would not be able to do so. Instead, they were going to replace them with limestone from Ashford, Ohio, which would match the color of the existing stonework and provided samples of the existing and proposed stone for the Commissioners to examine. He noted that the age and weathering of the exposed stonework on the library had caused the change in color and that the new stones would match what is on the building now.

Mr. Frey also stated that the chimney was in worse condition than originally thought. It was structurally unsound and the internal portions of the chimney were crumbling and could collapse into itself all the way down into the basement of the library. He explained that they were going to have to rebuild the internal structural portion of the chimney and then face the exterior with the new stonework. Although the internal portion would be completed soon, it would be a while before the stones arrived, so there may be some question as to whether the chimney was going to be left in that condition and he wanted everyone to know what was going on. The Commissioners thanked Ms. Campbell and Mr. Frey for the update.

### **COMMENT ON AN AMENDMENT TO A SPECIAL USE PERMIT FOR 1808 – 7<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE, ROCK ISLAND, WHICH IS LOCATED ACROSS THE STREET FROM 1906 – 7<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE, A LOCAL LANDMARK KNOWN AS THE POTTER HOUSE**

Next there came before the Commission a request for comments regarding an amendment to a Special Use Permit for 1808 – 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Mr. Griffith explained that the property owners wished to add an additional apartment unit upstairs and that they were also requesting that the Special Use Permit be revised to show that there would be no further public assembly at the site. Several of the Commissioners were familiar with the property and the previous use of the building as a fellowship hall for a church. The Commissioners commented that it appears to have been an excellent example of an adaptive reuse for the property.

After further discussion, Commissioner Cornish made a motion that the Preservation Commission had no objections to what is proposed for the property located at 1808 – 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Commissioner Calder seconded the motion and the Commission voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

**REVIEW OF THE MEETING SUMMARY FOR THE JUNE 19, 2013 PRESERVATION COMMISSION BYLAWS SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING AND APPOINTMENT OF AN ORDINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE**  
Chairman Vollman asked Mr. Griffith to provide a brief explanation of the difference between an ordinance and bylaws and the direction given staff by the City Attorney. Mr. Griffith explained that the preservation ordinance did not include specific guidance to staff or to the

Commission on several issues that bylaws normally provide. He stated that this and the City Attorney's recommendation that all public hearing bodies (Preservation Commission, Planning Commission and the Board of Zoning Appeals) should all include provisions in their respective ordinances regarding interested parties. Part of the reason for this is that interested party procedures were developed from the legal opinion from an Illinois Supreme Court Case. The Commissioners discussed the matter, asking if the ordinance revision was duplicative and Mr. Griffith replied that it was not since the case law had not made its way into the state statutes. After further discussion, Chairman Vollman asked who would be interested in serving on the subcommittee, adding that she felt that it was important for the subcommittee to consist of voting Commissioners. Eventually, Commissioners Cornish, Kavensky, Swords and Vollman volunteered to serve on the subcommittee. Commissioner Kavensky asked if the City Attorney could attend the first meeting. It was also decided that due to the upcoming holiday season and other conflicts, the subcommittee would try to hold their first meeting in February or March of next year.

#### **CONTINUED DISCUSSION ON OUTREACH EFFORTS TO OWNERS OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES**

Chairman Vollman stated that she wanted to continue the outreach efforts of the Preservation Commission and that her meeting with the Highland Park homeowners made her realize that outreach was desperately needed. Commissioner McVey stated that he didn't see how outreach would work for landmark owners if the Commission would not be contacted about what may impact our properties, adding that it was arrogant for the Commission to think that they represent all landmark owners. A lengthy discussion ensued amongst the Commissioners regarding notification of landmark property owners at the conclusion of which Ms. Howe stated that requiring notification to landmark owners about Preservation Commission meetings where comments are provided on zoning and land use requests would require an amendment to the preservation ordinance.

Commissioner Calder left the meeting at approximately 6:40 PM.

Chairman Vollman asked if anyone had any suggestions for speakers to various historic neighborhoods and property owners, stating that she thought the IHPA might be able to provide speakers, but wasn't sure if they could travel and do so. The Commissioners discussed several ideas for speakers and topics of discussion. It was determined that most people probably preferred a one-on-one or small group demonstration like they would have if they lived next door to somebody like Daryl Empen. Chairman Vollman stated that she heard a historic property owner say that he would let a window rot and fall out, and that meant that the Commission was not doing its job for the community, adding that the Commission should discuss it again at a later time.

Commissioner Kavensky left the meeting at approximately 6:47 PM.

### **PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING SCHEDULE FOR 2014**

Mr. Griffith stated that the Commissioners should have found a copy of the 2014 meeting schedule in their packets and that it would be posted onto the City's website for all to reference. He said that he usually likes to prepare a 14-month schedule which includes the last meeting of the current year, the upcoming year and the first meeting of the following year for easy reference and that he will prepare one like that for posting on the City's website.

### **OTHER BUSINESS**

Commissioner Strieter asked staff to check the information on the City's website because it looked like it need to be updated. He also asked about the Audubon site and the County Courthouse. Mr. Griffith responded that he only knew what he read in the newspaper. Commissioner McVey stated that he felt like the Preservation Commission had been used as a tool with the last-minute effort to save the school and that it had hurt their image.

Mr. Griffith stated that no applications had been submitted for the November 20<sup>th</sup> meeting but that the deadlines had still not passed. He asked the Commissioners to complete their Open Meetings Act training if they hadn't already done so and to forward their certificates to him or the City Clerk. He concluded by asking everyone to be mindful of any *ex parte* communications and to contact the Planning Office with any questions regarding any items on upcoming agendas.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

Seeing that there was no further business, Chairman Vollman asked for a motion to adjourn. Commissioner Strieter made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:52 PM which was seconded by Commissioner McVey. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Preservation Commission would be November 20, 2013.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Ben Griffith". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Ben Griffith, AICP