

**UNAPPROVED MINUTES OF THE  
ROCK ISLAND PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

Regular Meeting

4:00 p.m.

June 23, 2010

Location: Personnel Conference Room, Rock Island City Hall, 1528 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue, Rock Island, IL

Attendance:            ( X ) Present            (   ) Absent

( X ) Steve Andich

( X ) Bob Braun

(   ) Lendol Calder

( X ) David Cordes

( X ) Kent Cornish

( X ) Jane Koski

(   ) Mark McVey

( X ) John Strieter

( X ) Stephen Warren

(   ) Jeff Dismer (Assoc.)

(   ) Daryl Empen (Assoc.)

( X ) Diane Oestreich (Assoc.)

Staff Present: Jill Doak, Ellen Adams

Others Present: Steve Schrock, Steve Riexinger

Chairman Braun called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.

**Approval of Minutes of the May 26, 2010 Regular Meeting**

Commissioner Koski moved to approve the minutes of the May 26, 2010 regular meeting.

Commissioner Warren seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

**Case #2010-04** – Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 1614-34 18<sup>th</sup> Avenue, which is also known as Longview Apartments.

Ms. Doak gave the staff report. The Longview Condo Association would like to erect two portions of fencing along the front façade of the property. The fence will not run the entire length of the property. One section will run south along 17<sup>th</sup> Street and turn sharply at westward to meet the front corner of the building. This will impede pedestrians from cutting the corner across the property. The other section will be on the far west side of the site along the service sidewalk that goes to the back of the building. That section will have a gate that goes across the front, provide security to the rear of the building. The fencing will be constructed of iron from Boyler's Ornamental Iron. It will be 42" tall with 5" to 6" spacing between iron pickets. Staff recommends the Commission approve installation of the two fencing sections because they will add security to the property while not negatively impacting the historic fabric of the building and site.

Mr. Riexinger explained that there was once a hedge on the corner of 17<sup>th</sup> Street and 18<sup>th</sup> Avenue, which obstructed drivers' views.

Mr. Schrock added that police asked for the hedge to be removed.

Mr. Riexinger said that the fence will allow for an unobstructed view of the corner while keeping walkers from cutting the corner.

Commissioner Cornish moved to accept the staff recommendation to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to the Longview Condo Association.

Commissioner Warren seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

Mr. Schrock inquired if the commission could recommend contractors who repair wood windows.

Commissioners Oestreich, Cordes, and Koski provided Mr. Schrock with names of possible contractors.

### **2010 CLG Grant Update**

Ms. Doak showed the Commission the “save the date” postcards for the August 21<sup>st</sup> Weatherization Workshop. The postcards will be mailed out at the end of the week. The first eBlast was sent out on June 23<sup>rd</sup> and a flyer will be sent out around August 1<sup>st</sup>. About 1300 addresses will receive these mailings. These include Rock Island Landmarks, Highland Park Historic District properties, Broadway properties, MoSUS properties including owner-occupied double Queen Annes and Parkview Tudors, and historic Rock Island churches. Moline Landmarks and 20 other properties and Davenport Landmarks and addresses that have been assigned a historic name were also included.

Commissioner Oestreich asked if Davenport Neighborhood Organizations were included.

Ms. Doak replied that she has not yet received that list.

Commissioner Cordes inquired about the Scott County Historic Preservation Commission. He will forward information about the workshop to members.

Ms. Doak said that it will also be sent to Illinois and western Iowa CLGs and Main Street coordinators. Landmarks Illinois received the online version.

Commissioner Oestreich said that people have seemed very interested about the workshop, especially since it will be held on Arsenal Island. She believes there will be attendees from around the state.

Commissioner Koski stated that Arsenal Island security has gotten stricter. It should be emphasized to workshop participants that they need an ID to enter the Island.

Commissioner Warren replied that they are not as strict on Saturdays.

Commissioner Strieter asked if the workshop will be held only in Quarters One. He was concerned about space.

Ms. Doak replied that she expects about 50 participants, since generally about 10% of people who receive such invitations end up attending.

Commissioner Oestreich asked for clarification on what participants will have to pay for.

Ms. Doak explained that they will only be charged for lunch. Lunch details have not yet been finalized. The list of speakers is also not finalized. Bob Yapp will speak on windows and Tom Ayers will give tips for maximum impact. Rick Daley will not take this spot since he has a possible vacation conflict. A principal engineer from KJWW will probably speak, though it has not been verified. He lectures on geothermal topics across the nation.

Commissioner Cornish asked if that is the only topic speaker not finalized.

Ms. Doak replied that an energy audit speaker has not been identified. She has repeatedly contacted MidAmerican Energy, but they have not returned her calls. If commissioners have suggestions for an energy audit speaker, they should let Ms. Doak know soon. She said Illinois State Architect Mike Jackson also did not have a recommendation for this speaker.

Ms. Doak asked if there are any questions on the outlines the speakers have submitted. She felt the tax credits outline seemed confusing and too technical. However, Mark McVey spoke highly of Bob Weigel as a speaker and he seems friendly and well-spoken.

Commissioner Oestreich said that workshop participants will just want to hear about things that are relevant to them, since they do not have much of a choice about where their energy comes from.

Commissioner Cordes said that the speaker probably will not speak on things that are not pertinent to the audience. Sorting through the maze of possible tax credits will be helpful to participants.

Commissioner Cornish added that speaker can go into great detail on the talking points he provided, or not. Perhaps he should be told to mostly provide basic information.

Commissioner Oestreich said that he would probably want to know if the audience is mostly residential or commercial property owners.

Ms. Doak asked for the Commission's opinion of Bob Yapp's outline.

Chairman Braun asked if Mr. Yap will do a window repair demonstration.

Commissioner Warren said that a window demonstration will be more worthwhile than simply a lecture.

Ms. Doak explained that Mr. Yapp will have only 45 minutes to speak.

Commissioner Cornish suggested that the Commission tell Mr. Yapp that it is more interested in the "how to" than the "why" of window repair.

Ms. Doak said that some workshop participants will need to hear about why windows should be repaired instead of replaced.

Commissioner Streiter suggested that Mr. Yapp may have a "how to" video he could provide.

Ms. Doak said that the commission will make sure that Mr. Yapp provides a good balance and some level of demonstration.

### **Other Business**

Commissioners Oestreich and Koski reported on the CLG Workshop they attended in Crystal Lake.

Commissioner Oestreich reported that she disagreed with a speaker from the National Park Service on windows that would be acceptable to replace, though as the speaker pointed out, it is difficult to get someone to repair wood windows.

Commissioner Koski added that the speaker was more interested in the visual integrity of historic buildings, particularly public buildings. She said the speaker did not rule out the option of clad windows and pointed out "bad" restorations due to their modified proportions.

Commissioner Oestreich learned that you cannot have a divided pane with thermal pane, since the muttons would have to be very heavy. Clear Low E glass is good and increases efficiency, which is what will be used in the Jackson Square project. People should also do a cost comparison between repair and replacement before replacing wood windows.

Commissioner Koski stated that a speaker on lead from Champaign was very good.

Commissioner Oestreich was surprised that on the exterior of a structure, contractors must take care of lead paint if they disturb 20 square feet, not 6 as is the standard for interiors. Home owners have almost no way of knowing if there is lead.

Commissioner Oestreich said that Patrice Frey, the Director of Sustainability for the National Trust, was too casual and did not meet expectations. Ms. Frey said that preservationists need to lighten up and

grade resources. She said that Mt. Vernon should not have solar panels, but they would be acceptable on less significant structures, such as a nice four-square home. Commissioner Oestreich did not agree.

Commissioner Koski reported on a speaker who works for a commercial firm. He stated that people are prejudiced against vocabulary like “preservation” and “historical.” Words like “heritage” should be used instead in order to engage people in the area. A good phrase for preservationists is, “putting the past in the present tense.” The speaker said it is very important to use the press, but had no clear answer when Commissioner Oestreich asked how exactly to get good press. Also, naysayers’ comments on a historic preservation projects should be addressed at the outset.

Commissioner Oestreich added that he was one of the instigators of the National Trust slogan, “This place matters.” And feels that “Old friends are worth keeping” is an okay motto.

Commissioner Cordes said that preservation is seen as elitist because it often only focuses on grand houses of rich, dead, white men. However when focus is on preserving less impressive historic buildings, people do not understand the point.

Commissioner Oestreich said that the conference was well attended and the speakers were professional.

Ms. Doak announced an upcoming learning opportunity: The National Alliance of Preservation Commission Forum.

Ms. Doak passed around a BZA comment request for 1703 21<sup>st</sup> Street. The BZA deadline and Preservation Commission meeting are on the same day this month, so the Commission’s comment is needed now. Because it is a Highland Park property, the application for a variance request needs to go to the BZA and then will come to the Commission for a COA.

The Commissioners reviewed the report that Ms. Doak provided.

Ms. Doak explained that the request is to replace exactly in its location the existing French Gothic picket fence. The variance is needed to raise the height of the fence and for the corner setback. Because it is a double front yard, the fence height is supposed to be no taller than 48”. The Preservation Commission approved a fence with similar height and spacing of pickets for a house across the street in 1991. Given that approval, staff opinion is that the variances requested for this fence will have no impact on the historic structure or district.

Commissioner Cornish asked to clarify the location of the fence on the property.

Ms. Doak explained that corner houses have a “double front yard,” part of which is often considered a side yard.

Commissioner Cornish moved to approve the staff recommendation for the comment to BZA regarding the fence at 1703 21<sup>st</sup> Street.

Commissioner Cordes seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

Ms. Doak stated that the applicant for the variance will have to return to the Commission with a COA request at a future date.

Ms. Doak told the Commission that there will potentially be a special meeting before the next regular meeting. A Rock Island Landmark was broken into and its back door was virtually demolished. Home owners would like to put a solid door in its place for security purposes and would not like to wait until the end of July to do so. Ms. Doak asked if any Commissioners are planning to be out of town in July.

Chairman Braun and Commissioner Warren will be out of town the weekend of July 12<sup>th</sup>.

Ms. Doak told the Commission that there will be an Epitaphs event on Saturday, August 28 at Chippiannock Cemetery based on the Looney tour that Chippiannock put together. There will be actors at this traditional epitaphs event. In the past, the Commission has helped staff these events. If Commissioners are able, help will be needed from 11 a.m. to 4:30 p.m. that day. More information will be provided as the event approaches. Typically 400-900 people attend these types of events.

Ms. Doak explained that she received another letter and call concerning the Kelly House. The sender feels George Barber was the home's architect, not George Stauduhar. He requests that the Commission reconsider its stance that the Kelly House is not a Barber house in the Highland Park Historic District brochure. Ms. Doak read an internet comment written under a picture of the Kelly House. The individual in the online comments expressed his/her distaste that the Commission did not give credit to Barber for the Kelly House in the Highland Park brochure, but only added that the design "may have been influenced by pattern books of that time."

Commissioner Cordes said that the Kelly House is very similar to a Barber house, but there are so many things that are different that he would attribute it as a copy of Barber's design, but built by Stauduhar. Commissioner Cordes would accept changing the brochure to say that the design was influenced by Design #33 of Barber's Cottage Souvenir of 1892. Commissioner Cordes volunteered to write a letter back to the sender and explain the Commission's stance and reasoning.

Commissioner Oestreich added that Stauduhar did take credit or was attributed credit for buildings he did not design, such as the Chalet at Longview Park.

Ms. Doak reported on a Section 106 letter that came back from the State Historic Preservation Office for lead based paint work done on 819 21<sup>st</sup> Street. Their opinion was that the action submitted by Housing Loan Officer Carol Triebel meets the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines. The letter states that, "all historic wood windows facing 21<sup>st</sup> Street will be retained and repaired, not replaced. Windows located on the northeast and southeast facades may be replaced."

There being no other business, Commissioner Andich moved to adjourn the meeting.

Commissioner Koski seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously.

The Commission adjourned at 5:20 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jill Doak, Acting Secretary  
Rock Island Preservation Commission