

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE  
ROCK ISLAND PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

Regular Meeting

4:00 p.m.

December 15, 2010

Location: Personnel Conference Room, Rock Island City Hall, 1528 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue, Rock Island, IL

Attendance:            ( X ) Present                    (   ) Absent

(   ) Steve Andich

( X ) Bob Braun

(   ) Lendol Calder

( X ) David Cordes

( X ) Kent Cornish

(   ) Jane Koski

( X ) Mark McVey

( X ) John Strieter

(   ) Stephen Warren

(   ) Linda Anderson (Assoc.)

(   ) Jeff Dismer (Assoc.)

(   ) Daryl Empen (Assoc.)

( X ) Diane Oestreich (Assoc.)

Staff Present: Alan Carmen, Jill Doak, Ellen Adams

Others Present: Paul Fessler

Chairman Braun called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m.

**Approval of Minutes of the November 23, 2010 Rescheduled Regular Meeting**

Commissioner McVey moved to approve the minutes of the November 23, 2010 Rescheduled Regular Meeting.

Commissioner Cornish seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

**Case #2010-11** - Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 321 24<sup>th</sup> Street, which is also known as the Illinois Oil Products Building (Jackson Square)

Paul Fessler, NSP Construction Director for Rock Island Economic Growth Corporation (GROWTH), was present to represent applicant Brian Hollenback, GROWTH executive director.

Ms. Doak gave the staff report. Mr. Hollenback has applied for a Certificate of Appropriateness to modify construction plans at 321 24<sup>th</sup> Street. The Commission approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the comprehensive renovation of the building on May 26, 2010. Instead of infilling the bays between the pillars at the south end of the building, GROWTH would like to leave the south bays and the southernmost bay on the west side open. The bay infill treatment that was approved in May 2010 will still be installed in the remaining three bays on the 24<sup>th</sup> Street side. The aluminum and glass storefront will be pulled back at a slightly angled curve to enclose the commercial space. A colored stamped concrete in a brick running bond pattern will be used on the floor of the newly opened space. Staff recommends the Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the opened bays, curved glass wall and stamped concrete at the south end of 321 24<sup>th</sup> Street because the alterations will relate more appropriately to the historic appearance of the Illinois Oil Products Building.

Mr. Carmen noted that the application also includes a request to remove the southernmost door on the 24<sup>th</sup> street side of the building.

Commissioner Strieter asked Mr. Fessler why traditional brick flooring will not be used.

Ms. Doak said that stamped concrete fits better with the Secretary of the Interior Design Standards, since the goal of the project is not to restore the space to its original condition. Plus, it is unknown whether or not the floor was originally brick.

Mr. Fessler said that the open bays will act as an entrance to the building. The project architect and managers had not considered leaving the bays open until they were opened during construction. He

explained that the stamped concrete floor is lower in cost and will need less maintenance than brick. The floor will have a vintage feel and the dark color will match the dark brick of the historic building.

Chairman Braun asked whether lighting in the open entrance will be recessed can lights or wall-mounted fixtures.

Mr. Fessler said that he is unsure whether recessed can lights will be used, but more historically appropriate fixtures will be considered.

Ms. Doak said that lighting was not included in GROWTH's first Certificate of Appropriateness application. Additional façade lighting will require another Certificate of Appropriateness and recessed can lights will not.

Commissioner Cordes said that GROWTH should be commended for seeing the opportunity to improve the project's plan.

Commissioner Cornish asked for the architect's reasoning for the curved wall in the new open entrance.

Mr. Fessler said that there is a curved wall on the inside of the building that may match the proposed wall.

Commissioner Cordes moved to approve staff recommendation regarding the Certificate of Appropriateness application.

Commissioner Strieter seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

#### **Other Business**

Ms. Doak said that the 2011 Meeting Schedule will be sent to Commissioners. Meetings will be held the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of the month at 4 p.m. in the Personnel Conference Room.

Commissioner Cordes reported to the Commission that he responded to Mr. Schumacher about whether or not the Kelly House was designed by architect George Barber. For the past several years, Mr. Schumacher and other Barber enthusiasts have claimed that the Kelly House is an example of Barber's Cottage Souvenir #33, and not designed by George Studahauer, as Rock Island historical materials claim.

Commissioner Cordes wrote a thorough letter to Mr. Schumacher analyzing the differences between the Kelly House and houses built by Barber. He shared some of these differences with the Commission. The roof pitch of the Kelly House is less steep than that of Cottage Souvenir #33. All ornamentation on the Kelly House is in the gothic style, which Barber never used. The Kelly House has narrow trim, while Barber always used thicker trim boards. The way the staircase runs in the house and the space in the second floor tower are completely different than Cottage Souvenir #33.

Commissioner Cordes explained that the design for the Kelly House was probably inspired by Cottage Souvenir #33. It is unlikely that Barber would have built a house that deviates so significantly from his style. Studahauer did not plagiarize Barber's design, since there are vast differences between Cottage Souvenir #33 and the Kelly House.

Commissioner Cordes said that he will email the letter to Commissioners. The letter provides a position statement for Rock Island regarding the Kelly House's architect and may be used to respond to future claims that it is a Barber design.

There being no further business, the Commission adjourned at 4:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alan Carmen, Secretary  
Rock Island Preservation Commission