

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE
ROCK ISLAND PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

Regular Meeting

4:00 p.m.

January 26, 2011

Location: Personnel Conference Room, Rock Island City Hall, 1528 3rd Avenue, Rock Island, IL

Attendance: (X) Present () Absent

(X) Steve Andich

(X) Bob Braun

(X) Lendol Calder

(X) David Cordes

() Kent Cornish

(X) Jane Koski

(X) Mark McVey

() John Strieter

(X) Stephen Warren

() Linda Anderson (Assoc.)

() Jeff Dismer (Assoc.)

() Daryl Empen (Assoc.)

(X) Diane Oestreich (Assoc.)

Staff Present: Alan Carmen, Ellen Adams

Others Present: Aaron & Jesse Schultz, George Slaughter

Chairman Braun called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

Approval of Minutes of the December 15, 2010 Regular Meeting

Commissioner Koski moved to approve the minutes of the December 15, 2010 Regular Meeting.

Commissioner Andich seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

Case #2011-1 – Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 603 23rd Street, which is also known as the White House

Ms. Adams gave the staff report. Homeowners Aaron and Jesse Schultz have applied for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a six foot aluminum picket fence with four inch picket spacing in the double front yard of the property. It was determined by staff that the existing three foot iron picket fence is not original to the house and was installed in the last 15 years. The applicants have had problems with theft from their yard and believe the proposed fence would provide security. Staff recommends the Commission approve the Certificate request because the existing fence is not historic and the proposed fence design is appropriate and will not harm the historic fabric of the house or neighborhood. If the Commission approves the request, the applicants will need to apply for a zoning variance to allow for the 72 inch fence.

Commissioner Andich asked for clarification on fence height allowance and front yards.

Mr. Carmen explained that the zoning variance limits front yard fence height to 42 inches. Any yard that fronts a street or avenue is considered a front yard. Since the White House sits on a corner, it technically has two front yards.

Commissioner Oestreich said that a solid board fence would not be appropriate but approved of the transparent nature of the proposed aluminum pickets.

Mr. Jesse Schultz said their original plan was to construct a solid wood fence, but Ms. Doak recommended the aluminum picket style.

Commissioner Cordes said that the best place for a fence to connect with a house is in the back corner, but he approved of the plan since the proposed fence is visually open and will retain the character of the house and neighborhood.

Commissioner Cordes moved to approve staff recommendation regarding the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 603 23rd Street.

Commissioner Calder seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

Case #2011-2 – Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 1131 2nd Avenue, which is also known as the Mitchell House

Ms. Adams gave the staff report. A Certificate of Appropriateness was granted in 2007 which allowed for the demolition of the carriage house attached to the north side of the Mitchell House, on the condition that another Certificate would address the treatment of the resulting exposed wall and two door openings when it came time to demolish the structure. Owner George Slaughter now plans on demolishing the carriage house and would like to temporarily cover the exposed wall and door openings with vinyl siding and steel doors. Staff recommends approving the Certificate of Appropriateness request on the condition that the vinyl siding and steel doors remain for no longer than two years. If an application proposing a permanent solution for the wall and doors is not filed by January 26, 2013, code hearing procedures for noncompliance will commence.

Mr. Slaughter said that everything is ready for the demolition of the carriage house.

Commissioner Oestreich asked about the material of the exposed wall.

Mr. Slaughter said that it is an addition, not an original wall, and that it is not brick.

Mr. Carmen said that the wall is mostly plastered wood frame with some masonry at the base.

Commissioner McVey asked Mr. Slaughter if two years will be sufficient time to work out a permanent solution for the wall.

Mr. Slaughter said that he is thinking about proposing a brick-looking vinyl siding and will later ask the Commission their opinion on possible wall coverings.

Mr. Carmen told Mr. Slaughter that if in two years he is not ready to propose a permanent solution, he may return to the Commission and request an extension.

Commissioner Cordes said that he does not have a problem with the proposed temporary coverings and encouraged Mr. Slaughter to discuss permanent coverings with Ms. Doak.

Commissioner McVey asked if Mr. Slaughter would be required to cover the exposed wall with brick.

Mr. Carmen replied that since the exposed wall is an addition, there is no replacement in kind required and thus there are other options besides brick.

Commissioner Cordes told Mr. Slaughter that brick-looking vinyl siding as a permanent solution would not be approved by the Commission.

Commissioner Koski moved to approve staff recommendation regarding the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 1131 2nd Avenue, including imposing a two year time limit.

Commissioner Andich seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

Mr. Carmen told Mr. Slaughter that he will prepare a Certificate and that the demolition permit for the carriage house can be issued tomorrow.

Mr. Slaughter asked the Commission for guidance concerning the reconstruction of the Mitchell House's cupola. He has been researching slate roofs and found that they have not been done for 70 to 80 years. He felt that getting the slate custom cut and installed on the uniquely shaped cupola would not be feasible.

Mr. Carmen asked the Commission if they know of any slate suppliers.

Commissioner Oestreich recommended Mr. Slaughter call the City of Peoria and request contact information of people who work on slate roofs, since there are many in Peoria. Also, Commissioner Oestreich said that

the scalloped slate tile on the roof of 709 20th Street was redone a number of years ago using a synthetic rubber material, and it looks great.

Commissioner Cordes recommended Mr. Slaughter contact White Roofing in Davenport and Renaissance Roofing in Rockford, IL because they both have experience with slate and tile roofs.

Mr. Slaughter provided the Commission with his email address so that Commissioners may contact him if they have any more sources to suggest.

Other Business

Mr. Carmen notified the Commission that Landmark Illinois' 10 Most Endangered Structures application was submitted for the West End Settlement.

Chairman Braun said that the Broadway house at 547 23rd Street was recently demolished and asked whether that should have triggered a review by the Commission.

Mr. Carmen explained that the demolition did not require Commission review because the house was not a local landmark and no zoning action was needed that would have impacted an adjacent landmark.

Commissioner Oestreich is working on the landmark designation for the West End Settlement building. She provided Commissioners with pictures of the West End Settlement today, the building in 1914, and Stauduhar's sketches for what is often believed to be the West End Settlement. Ms. Oestreich noted that the sketch, provided by a lady writing a book on Stauduhar, bears only slight resemblance to the actual West End Settlement building. The sketch is much more elaborate than the actual building and includes three and a half stories. Construction on the building began in 1908 and finished the next year, but there is no story in the newspaper about the building until 1912. Ms. Oestreich said that while the second floor is beautiful, the building is not designed very well; all aspects are very horizontal, the first and second floors do not relate well, and the entrance is off-center. She suggested that perhaps Studahauer began the project but someone else finished it. She asked the Commission for their thoughts.

Commissioner Koski asked if the West End Settlement was in the floodplain at the time it was built, because perhaps that could be the reason for the stone used on the first level.

Mr. Carmen said that the building would have been subject to flooding, but that its surrounding area was fully developed.

Commissioner Cordes suggested that perhaps the first floor of the building was built and occupied for awhile before the second floor was added. He noted that the sketch does have some resemblance to the building, like the stone used on the first level. He said that the building looks like an unusual interpretation of a raised basement building.

Commissioner Oestreich said that the building probably was not built in two parts with a long delay between them since it was finished within a year. She feels that a respected architect like Stauduhar would do a better job with the fenestration. In her landmark application, Ms. Oestreich said she will probably write that the project started with Stauduhar but it is unknown whether he finished the building. She will also include Prairie, Craftsman, and Arts and Crafts as the architectural style.

Commissioner Cordes speculated that perhaps Susanne Denkmann did not want to pay for the monumental building in the Stauduhar sketch so the plans were simplified.

There being no further business, the Commission adjourned at 4:53 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alan Carmen, Secretary
Rock Island Preservation Commission