

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE
ROCK ISLAND PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

Regular Meeting

4:00 p.m.

February 23, 2011

Location: Personnel Conference Room, Rock Island City Hall, 1528 3rd Avenue, Rock Island, IL

Attendance: (X) Present () Absent

(X) Steve Andich

(X) Bob Braun

(X) Lendol Calder

(X) David Cordes

(X) Kent Cornish

(X) Jane Koski

(X) Mark McVey

() John Strieter

(X) Stephen Warren

(X) Linda Anderson (Assoc.)

() Jeff Dismer (Assoc.)

() Daryl Empen (Assoc.)

(X) Diane Oestreich (Assoc.)

Staff Present: Alan Carmen, Jill Doak, Ellen Adams

Others Present: Steven Schrock

Chairman Braun called the meeting to order at 4:04 p.m.

Approval of Minutes of the January 26, 2011 Regular Meeting

Commissioner Andich moved to approve the minutes of the January 26, 2011 Regular Meeting.

Commissioner Calder seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

Case #2011-3 – Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 1614-34 18th Avenue, which is also known as Longview Condominiums

Ms. Doak gave the staff report. Longview Homeowners Association Board Member Steven Schrock has submitted an application to remove the historic tile roof on the courtyard gazebo of Longview Apartments and replace the tile with a stone-coated metal roof system. Complete removal of the historic tile is contrary to the *Residential Design Guidelines* and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Further, no mention is made in the application of retaining the roof hip or ridge tiles, which will be difficult to duplicate with modern materials. Staff recommends the Commission deny the Certificate of Appropriateness for removal and replacement of the gazebo roof tiles and urge the applicant to resubmit their application, following the course of action outlined in the agenda report.

Mr. Schrock said that the gazebo tiles are concrete, not clay. The tiles are dissolving and crumble when touched. He has counted eight sizeable holes in the roof. Mr. Schrock believes that the replacement material suggested by Advanced Construction will match almost identically and will be the most economical course of action.

Commissioner Cordes suggested Renaissance Roofing in Rockford, IL take a look at the roof.

Mr. Schrock said that he doubts the tiles can be salvaged since they dissolve when touched.

Commissioner Cordes said that he is not comfortable approving the replacement of the tiles without an evaluation by a tile roofing company. He suggested White Roofing.

Mr. Schrock said that he contacted White Roofing, and they were not willing to evaluate the roof.

Commissioner Calder asked if the tiles can be replaced with new concrete tiles.

Commissioner Cordes said that it is a question of whether matching salvaged tiles can be found.

Commissioner McVey said that concrete does not last as long as clay.

Associate member Oestreich suggested replacing the concrete tiles with clay.

Commissioner Warren said that the gazebo is the most interesting aspect of the apartment complex and asked Mr. Schrock if he could do more searching to try to find an adequate tile company.

Mr. Schrock said that he can do more searching, but he believes the proposed material looks almost the same as the existing tiles.

Ms. Doak said that the roof profile shown in the example photos of the proposed material looks different than the profile of the existing roof.

Chairman Braun said that more information is needed on availability of existing matching tile and new materials. Also, the economic factor of the project cannot be taken into account as a reason to accept the application. In order to do so, a Certificate of Economic Hardship would need to be granted.

Mr. Schrock said that he is worried about the wellbeing of the structure if the roof is not repaired in a timely manner.

Commissioner Cornish noted that the work would not be able to be done for a month or so, anyway.

Associate member Oestreich urged Mr. Schrock to ask the tile company to do something to replicate the crests on the ridge tiles.

Commissioner Cordes said that those tiles may not be as deteriorated and that they may be able to reuse the ridge and hip junction tiles. Those pieces are very valuable and costly to buy.

Commissioner Cordes moved to reject the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness based on the information provided, in concurrence with the staff report.

Commissioner Warren seconded the motion.

Mr. Carmen explained that Mr. Schrock can appeal the Commission's decision to City Council within 30 days. There is no rule against refiling the same application.

Ms. Doak told Mr. Schrock that on the revised application, some mention should be made of what will be done with the hip and ridge tiles.

Associate member Anderson suggested Mr. Schrock provide a sample of the proposed material for the Commission.

The motion passed unanimously.

Appointments to Preliminary Determination Subcommittee

Mr. Carmen explained that the Subcommittee reviews submissions of applications for landmark status and makes a recommendation to the Commission regarding whether the application should be approved.

Ms. Doak added that the purpose of the Subcommittee is to have the application fully reviewed before it is brought to the Commission.

Commissioners Cordes, McVey, and Calder volunteered for the Subcommittee.

Commissioner Andich moved to accept the group.

Commissioner Cornish seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

Other Business

Ms. Doak said that Landmarks Illinois requested more information regarding the tax status of the West End Settlement building. The 2007 and 2008 taxes have been paid, but the 2009 taxes have not. Those taxes were purchased by a different tax buyer. Landmarks Illinois told Ms. Doak that West End Settlement is on the shortlist for 10 Most designation.

Ms. Doak reported that Mike Ward from IHPA called to say that the Preservation Commission has been awarded the 2011 CLG Grant. The paperwork will take a few months to finalize. Work on the grant project will not begin until the paperwork is complete because of federal budget uncertainty.

Ms. Doak welcomed the Commission to take invitations to the 2011 Farnam Dinner, which will be held on March 11 in Davenport. The theme will be railroads and the speaker will be the Chairman of the Iowa Interstate Railroad.

Ms. Doak said that the terms of Commissioners Andich and McVey and Chairman Braun will end at the March meeting. Chairman Braun cannot be reappointed due to the term limit. A Rock Island registered architect will need to fill the position. Commissioners should contact Ms. Doak with nominations.

Mr. Carmen explained that the nominees are presented to the Mayor, who then makes a selection, with City Council approving appointments.

Commissioner Calder asked how many architects live in Rock Island and Chairman Braun said there are four.

Commissioner Cordes suggested Colleen Vollman, who is buying the Plumber House, as a possible future Commissioner; she is an architectural historian.

Ms. Doak told the Commission about the new Neighborhood Partners' Immigration Task Force and the upcoming Study Circles process. She explained that Rock Island has experienced an influx of immigrants and this method of public dialogue, which will involve 80 to 150 participants, will open up communication between these immigrants and longtime Rock Island residents. Ms. Doak asked Commissioners to consider volunteering as facilitators for the Study Circles. A day of training will be involved and a commitment of seven meetings in April and May will be necessary. Those interested should contact Ms. Doak. Commissioners who do not wish to lead a group can be participants.

Commissioners Andich, Cornish, and McVey said they may be interested in being facilitators.

Associate member Oestreich reported that the Illinois Statewide Preservation Conference will be held June 2-4 in Godfrey, IL.

Commissioner Koski said that she found last years' conference very informative as a new committee member.

Ms. Doak said that the National Main Streets Conference will be held May 22-25 in Des Moines, IA. The Illinois Main Street program is currently on probation and is being run regionally through the Department of Commerce and Economic Opportunity.

Commissioner Cordes provided the Commission with digital and paper copies of architect Robert Spencer's publication on casement windows. Commissioners discussed the location of *Western Architect*, which features the Denkmann-Hauberg House.

There being no further business, the Commission adjourned at 5:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alan Carmen, Secretary
Rock Island Preservation Commission