

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE  
ROCK ISLAND PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

Regular Meeting

4:00 p.m.

March 23, 2011

Location: Personnel Conference Room, Rock Island City Hall, 1528 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue, Rock Island, IL

Attendance:            ( X ) Present            (   ) Absent

(   ) Steve Andich	( X ) John Strieter
( X ) Bob Braun	( X ) Stephen Warren
( X ) Lendol Calder	( X ) Linda Anderson (Assoc.)
( X ) David Cordes	(   ) Jeff Dismar (Assoc.)
( X ) Kent Cornish	( X ) Daryl Empen (Assoc.)
( X ) Jane Koski	( X ) Diane Oestreich (Assoc.)
( X ) Mark McVey	

Staff Present: Alan Carmen, Jill Doak, Ellen Adams

Others Present: Paul Fessler, Brian Hollenback, Ben Reeder, Steven Schrock

Note: Case numbers listed on the agenda packet were out of order; the case numbers in the minutes are correct.

Chairman Braun called the meeting to order at 4:08 p.m.

**Approval of Minutes of the February 23, 2011 Regular Meeting**

Commissioner Koski moved to approve the minutes of the February 23, 2011 Regular Meeting. Commissioner McVey seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

The two Certificate of Appropriateness applicants were not yet present so the Commission addressed agenda item six.

**Section 106 Review for Infill Construction at 1206-10 19<sup>th</sup> Street and 1042 17<sup>th</sup> Street**

Chairman Brawn declared a conflict of interest and due to the absence of Vice Chair Andich, Commissioner Calder chaired this portion of the meeting.

Ms. Adams gave the staff report. She reported that Rock Island Economic Growth Corporation (GROWTH) has submitted the infill house design and site plans for infill construction at two Broadway Historic District properties. Comment to IHPA regarding the infill construction plans is requested from the Preservation Commission. Staff recommended the Commission comment to IHPA that the house design for 1206-10 19<sup>th</sup> Street and 1042 17<sup>th</sup> Street is appropriate and compatible with the historic neighborhood. In order to retain the rhythm and pattern of the block face, the front setback of both homes should be modified and determined by averaging the setback of neighboring properties.

GROWTH President Brian Hollenback and Paul Fessler were present to answer questions regarding the infill construction.

Commissioner McVey asked why the garage is offset from the house at 1206-10 19<sup>th</sup> Street.

Mr. Fessler explained that offsetting the garage makes it easier to build due to the slope of the back alley.

Commissioner Cordes reported that he informally asked Mr. Hollenback and Mr. Fessler if the roof pitch could be increased from 8 over 12 to 10 over 12, and they said it could.

Mr. Hollenback said GROWTH does not have a problem with increasing the roof pitch because they want the home to be compatible with the neighborhood. Doing so may add another foot to the height of the home. The foundation height may need to be taken into consideration in order to avoid making the home too tall. He added that GROWTH will not do lattice work that is not framed in on the front porch.

The color of the house pictured in the agenda packet is not accurate. Mr. Fessler showed the Commission the olive-green color that will be used. Trim will be cream and beige-pink.

Mr. Fessler said after adjusting the design, the floor and porch elevations come down a little closer, making the code rail on the porch not required.

Associate member Oestreich recommended decreasing the pitch of the porch roof so that less area would be covered.

Commissioner Cordes said the house design is compatible in massing to Broadway homes but does not appear to be a replica of the older homes. New homes are supposed to be distinguishable as new structures.

Mr. Hollenback reported that, since federal dollars are being spent on the infill construction and other homes GROWTH is rehabbing, every dollar spent on special detailing must be defended. This presents a challenge to GROWTH because they want to add extra elements, but such elements are considered luxury items and must be defended. Mr. Hollenback urged Commissioners to speak positively about the importance of spending additional dollars on details.

Associate member Oestreich recommended reversing the design of both homes, since it is better to have the living room on the south side of the house rather than the north side; the stairs should be on the north side.

Mr. Fessler said there are exceptions to that rule. For the 19<sup>th</sup> Street home, the view from the living room windows will be better on the north side due to the slope of the property.

Associate member Oestreich agreed, but supported reversing the design for the 17<sup>th</sup> Street home.

Commissioner McVey said the houses should fit in with the neighborhood, but not replicate older homes. This same line of defense could be used to support the new roofline.

Ms. Doak said *Residential Design Guidelines* specifically address roof slope and shape being compatible for new construction.

Ms. Doak complimented GROWTH on the appropriate and attractive design of the infill homes and their attention to detail.

Commissioner McVey said if the details were not included, new construction would be a hindrance to the neighborhood.

Associate member Oestreich asked where the utilities will be located.

Mr. Fessler said the utilities have not yet been specified and associate member Oestreich recommended placing them in an unobtrusive location.

Commissioner McVey asked what GROWTH will do with the existing garage at the 19<sup>th</sup> Street property.

Mr. Fessler said they are considering a higher pitched roof. A full plan was not presented to the Commission, but it could be.

Associate member Oestreich asked if there will be basement windows and Mr. Hollenback said there will be an egress window.

Commissioner Strieter asked why the homes will have only two bedrooms instead of three and Mr. Hollenback said the homes will have a second floor loft instead of a third bedroom. This allows the two bedrooms to be larger.

Mr. Hollenback added that GROWTH is also building four or five different homes in other areas of the City.

Associate member Oestreich asked about the plan for the front door of the homes and Mr. Hollenback said porches and front doors are given special attention for all of GROWTH's projects.

Associate member Oestreich asked if a window will be added on the stairwell of the new homes, and Mr. Hollenback confirmed that the window has been added to the plans.

Commissioner McVey moved for the Preservation Commission to comment positively to IHPA on the infill house design for 1206-10 19<sup>th</sup> Street and 1042 17<sup>th</sup> Street because it is appropriate and compatible with Broadway Historic District. In addition, without the attention to detail the resulting houses could be a detriment to this key and historic neighborhood of Rock Island. The Commission also supports the 10 over 12 roof pitch, the stairwell window, averaging the front yard setbacks of neighboring properties, and the framed lattice work.

Commissioner Cordes seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously, with Chairman Braun in abstention.

Associate member Oestreich said all of GROWTH's infill projects have been a learning experience for everyone. She is pleased with the progress GROWTH has made.

Mr. Hollenback mentioned the work GROWTH is doing on 917 19<sup>th</sup> Street and 544 23<sup>rd</sup> Street and associate member Oestreich asked if GROWTH is interested in landmarking either property.

Mr. Hollenback said they are not interested in landmarking the properties at this time due to funding sources, but doing so is a possibility before the homes are sold.

Associate member Anderson thanked GROWTH for the renovation of 1711 21<sup>st</sup> Street in Highland Park and commented that the ribbon cutting ceremony was very nice. Mr. Hollenback thanked the Highland Park neighborhood for the terrific turnout at the ribbon cutting.

**Case #2011-7** – Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 1614-34 18<sup>th</sup> Avenue, which is also known as Longview Condominiums

Ms. Adams gave the report. Mr. Schrock, Longview Homeowners Association board member, has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the historic concrete tile roof on the courtyard gazebo of Longview Apartments with used Ludowici French style clay tiles. Staff recommends the Commission approve the request because replacing the existing concrete tiles with used clay tiles will not significantly alter the appearance of the gazebo, is an acceptable alternate material, and will protect the structure from deterioration.

Commissioner Cordes moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as stated in the staff recommendation. Commissioner Koski seconded the motion.

Commissioner Cordes said he believes the plan is the best possible solution for replacing the deteriorating concrete tile.

Mr. Schrock said the concrete tile could be replaced identically, but the cost would be triple that of the used clay tile.

Commissioner Cordes said the design of the existing concrete tile was probably copied from the Ludowici tile. Concrete, an inferior material, lasted 80 years. The clay tiles will probably last over 100 years.

The motion passed unanimously.

Associate member Oestreich told Mr. Schrock that the Commission will give advice prior to filing a COA application. Seeking advice from the Commission could save him time in the future.

**Case # 2011-5** – Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 2103 18<sup>th</sup> Avenue, which is located in the Highland Park Historic District

Ms. Adams gave the staff report. Homeowner Ben Reeder has applied for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace five windows with double-hung vinyl clad replacement windows. Staff recommends approving the request because a majority of the other windows in the home have already been replaced and the style of the proposed windows preserves the home's sense of time and will not harm the historic fabric of the Highland Park Historic District.

Commissioner McVey said the preservation ordinance preserves a house as is; although the windows on the home are aluminum, the ordinance is designed to preserve the house at the point in time in which the historic district was established.

Commissioner Strieter asked whether the existing replacement windows were installed before or after the Highland Park Historic District designation and Commissioner McVey answered before.

Commissioner Cordes asked if the existing replacement windows are vinyl storms or complete vinyl replacement windows and if the existing windows to be replaced are original windows with aluminum storms or are complete replacement windows.

Mr. Reeder said the existing replacement windows are complete vinyl windows with half a storm. The existing windows to be replaced are original windows with aluminum storms.

Commissioner Cordes said, because of changes that have already been made and to allow the house to look finished, he agrees with the staff recommendation. He hopes that the vinyl windows will turn out to have greater longevity than many vinyl windows. Commissioner Cordes also recommended storing the original window sash for possible future use.

Mr. Reeder said he would like to improve the home in a practical way. He said it would be impractical to replace all of the windows with windows that match the originals.

Commissioner Cornish moved to accept the staff recommendation. Commissioner Calder seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

### **Other Business**

Mr. Carmen provided Commissioners with a handout of what the City is doing to prepare for the possible upcoming flood. He said there is a 65% chance of a tying the record flood of 1993. There is a 30% of the river reaching a 26 foot crest, which would be 3.5 feet higher than the record flood. The map provided on the handout indicates the worst case scenario if there is a levee failure.

Mr. Carmen stated that it is with displeasure that the Commission must say goodbye to Bob Braun. He served on the Commission for six years, the past four of which he has been Chairman. Chairman Braun was presented a plaque and was thanked and given a round of applause by the Commission.

Ms. Doak thanked Commissioners Cornish, Andich, and McVey for volunteering as facilitators in the upcoming Changing Faces: Refugees & Immigrants in Rock Island study circles. Ms. Doak encouraged Commissioners to register as participants and to pass the information on to others who may be interested.

Ms. Doak reported the landmark application for West End Settlement has been received. The Preliminary Determination Subcommittee agreed to meet for a review of the application on Thursday, March 31 at 4 p.m.

Associate member Oestreich reported that West End Settlement was chosen as one of Landmarks Illinois' Ten Most Endangered properties. The official announcement will be made April 6 in Springfield. She is going to the ceremony and asked other Commissioners to join her.

Ms. Doak said the Commission's next meeting, April 27, will be held at 5:15 p.m. because it will be a Public Hearing to address the landmark application. Because the terms of Chairman Braun and Vice-Chairman Andich are ending at this meeting, the Commission had to choose an interim chair to lead the next meeting.

Commissioner Strieter nominated Commissioner Cornish to serve as interim chair at the April 27 meeting of the Preservation Commission.

Commissioner Cordes seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

Associate member Oestreich reported that the IAHPC Conference will be held June 2-4.

Ms. Doak reported that the City has received the paperwork for the 2011 CLG grant. Staff is holding onto the paperwork until CDBG funding is allocated by the federal government to ensure that the City will be able to match the CLG grant.

Associate member Empen said Broadway Historic District Board is hosting a Trivia Night on April 8.

There being no further business, the Commission adjourned at 5:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alan Carmen, Secretary  
Rock Island Preservation Commission