

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE
ROCK ISLAND PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

Regular Meeting

4:00 p.m.

May 26, 2010

Location: Personnel Conference Room, Rock Island City Hall, 1528 3rd Avenue, Rock Island, IL

Attendance: (X) Present () Absent

(X) Steve Andich

(X) Bob Braun

(X) Lendol Calder

(X) David Cordes

() Kent Cornish

() Jane Koski

(X) Mark McVey

(X) John Strieter

(X) Stephen Warren

() Jeff Dismer (Assoc.)

() Daryl Empen (Assoc.)

(X) Diane Oestreich (Assoc.)

Staff Present: Alan Carmen, Jill Doak, Ellen Adams

Others Present: Brian Hollenback, AJ Loss

Chairman Braun called the meeting to order at 4:10 p.m.

Approval of Minutes of the April 28, 2010 Regular Meeting

Associate member Oestreich had one correction in the minutes. On page two it states, "She said she assumes the new construction would have a foundation..." It should state, "She said she assumes the new construction would *not* have a foundation..."

Commissioner Andich moved to approve the minutes of the April 28, 2010 regular meeting as amended. Commissioner Calder seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously.

Welcome New Commissioners John Strieter and Stephen Warren

Commissioner Warren introduced himself. He is a historian at Augustana College and lives in the Highland Park Historic District. He is very interested in the Commission and feels it is a privilege to serve Rock Island.

Commissioner Strieter stated that he was born in Rock Island in 1929. He started a development business in 1956, which was responsible for the building of several subdivisions in Rock Island and other communities, with a total of 1,500 homes. His office is located at 2100 18th Avenue. He is happy to be part of the Preservation Commission and believes it is an interesting group.

Election of Officers: Chair and Vice-Chair

Chairman Braun opened the floor to nominations for chair and vice-chair.

Commissioner Andich nominated Chairman Braun to chair, and Chairman Braun accepted the nomination.

Commissioner Calder nominated Commissioner Andich to vice-chair, and Commissioner Andich accepted the nomination.

Commissioner McVey seconded both nominations.

As there were no other nominations, Commissioner Cordes moved to close nominations. Commissioner McVey seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

The Commission voted unanimously for Commissioner Braun as chair and Commissioner Andich as vice-chair for one-year terms.

Case #2010-03 – Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 321 24th Street, which is also known as the Illinois Oil Products Building.

Ms. Doak gave the staff report. She reminded the Commission that the Certificate of Appropriateness covers only the metes and bounds description for the office portion. It does not include the parking lot or the extension that runs from the office building to the east, since those areas are not considered part of the Rock Island Landmark designation. There are several major headers for the Certificate components, each of which she discussed.

The first component was the cleaning, repair, and repointing of the brick and terra cotta. The application details were very specific. Staff believes standards are met according to *Residential Design Guidelines* and Preservation Brief #2. Regarding the cleaning and repair of the terra cotta, Preservation Brief #2 states that minor spalling should simply be coated and sealed. Ms. Doak stated that it is unclear from the application what is considered major spalling and whether those items are to be replicated or sealed. To answer that, the applicants should make documentation as inspections and work are done. Specifications should be modified so that the terra cotta has a less invasive procedure done and is simply sealed. If there are portions of the terra cotta that need more direct action taken on its repair, then those components should be submitted for a future Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioner Strieter asked if the applicants will simply seal, not fill, the terra cotta

Ms. Doak explained that it is not recommended to fill since it would be difficult to match the original terra cotta. In most cases, it is recommended simply to be sealed.

The next component of the application concerned window replacement. Ms. Doak reported that the applicant wishes to replace all existing one over one windows, since the majority of these are integrated into the living units and there are efficiency standards that must be met in such units. The existing windows are constructed of steel. Based on a physical inspection, staff believes the windows were original to the building. This type of steel window was introduced in the 1920s and the building was built around 1922, so it was a new technology at the time. Based on a physical condition assessment, staff found that the windows are quite deteriorated, and repair may not be possible. Corrosion is the main consideration for the condition of the windows. The Preservation Brief says that if rust is penetrated deep into the metal it is usually considered heavy corrosion. Staff observed several examples of heavy corrosion. Steel windows that are corroded must be removed to be repaired. To be removed, frames would need to be bent or cut. The Preservation Brief suggests that only the most significant windows should be removed to be repaired. For less significant windows, replacement with compatible new windows may be acceptable. Staff does not believe the steel windows will meet the thermal efficiency codes that will be required. Also, none will be able to be torn out intact. Because of these issues, staff suggests that windows be replaced with black anodized, one over one aluminum windows with very narrow frames to match the building's exterior.

Associate member Oestreich asked why black anodized is recommended.

Ms. Doak responded that historic images of the building show that a dark color was used.

Mr. Loss of Busch Construction Company stated that the west entrance is dark brown anodized and looks black.

Commissioner Cordes stated that at the time the building was built, they did not have dark brown anodized, but it seems reasonable that it would have originally been black because this was the color very often used on storm windows and industrial windows at the time. If the steel windows were of a different style it would be more difficult to accept window replacement. However because they are simply one over one windows, replacing them would not be that noticeable. Although there is loss of original fabric, Commissioner Cordes believes the request is reasonable.

Commissioner Strieter asked if the developers have considered using double glazing rather than single for insulation purposes.

Mr. Loss replied that the architect is planning to use two panes of glass, with the exterior side of the interior pane low E coating.

Associate member Oestreich wanted to be sure that that is not apparent from the outside.

Mr. Loss replied that no, it is not reflective.

Mr. Carmen said that if the COA is approved, it will be a challenge to remove the windows without damaging the terra cotta.

Ms. Doak stated that, due to the difficulty of removing the City Hall windows, if the window replacement is approved, the resolution will state that great care should be taken in the removal of the existing windows.

Commissioner Strieter asked if all windows will be replaced, and Ms. Doak confirmed.

Ms. Doak gave the report on the next aspect of the COA regarding first floor infill. The desire is to remove the plywood and garage doors and fill in the openings with storefront framing, giving it an open appearance. Since the corner of the building was once open for a gas station operation, this will allow some semblance of open space to be preserved. As little base or transom framing as possible will be used so that there will be the appearance of open space. The storefront framing will be recessed enough so that the sides of the terra cotta on the support columns will still be visible. Glass will be inserted into the opening and framing will be aluminum. Glass should have very little reflective quality and read as a clear window.

Associate member Oestreich was concerned that traffic on the 4th Avenue side of the building will cause splashing on the storefront glass. She stated that because of that, she would not have a problem with a small brick base.

Commissioner McVey was concerned with cars veering into the corner of the building.

Commissioner Cordes stated that that has yet to be an issue with the building. Mr. Cordes also believes that spandrel glass panels may be used on the bottom of the storefront windows to deal with splashing. These panels would not be noticeable from the outside and would create a solid wall on the inside. He also recommended that framing should be as dark as possible in order to fit with the building.

Ms. Doak next reported on the new openings planned on the north and east facades. Although the *Residential Design Guidelines* say that new openings are generally not allowed, they will be necessary since they are for dwelling spaces and light and egress are building code requirements. Windows will be punched into the first floor of the north elevation and the second floor of the east elevation.

Ms. Doak also reported on the east façade fenestration changes. Angle drives to the service doors will be leveled and the overhead garage door will be shortened to ensure a weather tight seal. Existing doors and windows will remain as is, with the exception of the window beneath the fire escape. It will be removed and replaced with a new fire-rated utilitarian metal door. Very few changes are being made since the first floor space has yet to be rented. Future changes may be desired when the space is leased.

Ms. Doak stated that staff recommends the Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the alterations that were discussed.

Commissioner McVey asked if there were any parts of the terra cotta where water has gotten into the steel that holds it.

Mr. Loss replied that as far as they can tell the terra cotta is intact and little water penetration has occurred.

Commissioner Calder moved to accept the staff recommendation for the Certificate of Appropriateness for the Illinois Oil Company Building.

Commissioner Cordes seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.

Ms. Doak advised the applicants that if they decide that other changes to the terra cotta need to be made once they've done the analysis, specifications should be rewritten for their and the Commission's benefit. Also, glass color should be neutral.

2009 CLG Grant Update

Ms. Doak gave the staff report. The request to amend the grant was approved. Staff will go forward with a request for services to provide engineering estimates to stabilize the Old Lincoln School building in June. The project will need to be completed by September 30.

2010 CLG Grant Update

Ms. Doak gave the staff report. She explained that due to her mother's illness and son's injury, it would help in her workload management if there are components of the project that Commissioners would be willing to undertake.

Mr. Carmen explained that identification of speakers, logistical issues, marketing, and registration need to be dealt with. Commissioners should report to him or Jill if there is anything for which they would like to provide support.

Driehaus Preservation Awards Nominations

Chairman Braun said that nominations are due July 1, 2010.

Ms. Doak reported that the recent MoSUS application put together for the Illinois State Historical Society award may fit the Driehaus Preservation Awards education category well, if a Commissioner would like to adapt and submit it.

Mr. Carmen stated that it would be a good project on which the new Planning and Redevelopment Division intern can work.

Commissioner Cordes feels that the Illinois Oil Company project would fit nicely in the kinds of projects that the National Trust for Historic Preservation chooses to recognize in their awards.

Ms. Doak replied that historic tax credits are not being received for the Illinois Oil Company project and that the rest of the building would not receive the same kind of treatment as the office portion. Because of this, it may be unlikely that it would receive an award from the National Trust.

Mr. Carmen stated that the idea is worthy to be kept in the back of the Commission's minds as the project progresses.

Review and Approval of 2009-2010 Certified Local Government Annual Report

Ms. Doak reported that the additions to the document suggested by Commissioner Oestreich have been made. One such addition was that Daryl Empen is the webmaster for the Broadway Historic District's website. Ms. Doak asked for any other changes or additions.

Since there were no other changes, Commissioner Cordes made a motion to approve the report. Commissioner Andich seconded the motion, which was approved unanimously.

Ms. Doak added that complete copies of the report will be given to local libraries and an abbreviated copy will be given to City Council.

Other Business

Ms. Doak said that there will be a June meeting. Also, two Commission members will be going to Crystal Lake.

Associate member Oestreich reported that a city historic preservation planner in West Palm Beach, FL suggested that people should be required to describe what they are going to do and how it meets the guidelines when applying for a COA. This will ensure that applicants read the guidelines, thereby educating the public and requiring less effort from City staff.

Associate member Oestreich also reported that there is a survey being taken regarding whether the National Park Service should have guidelines for the sustainability of historic structures. There are questions regarding floor heating, geothermal heating, interior/exterior shutters/drapes, solar panels, and windmills. Ms. Oestreich emphasized changes that have a visual or permanent effect on the property. She will send the survey link to the Commission members.

Commissioner McVey said that associate member Oestreich's idea to request COA applicants for a description on how their proposed alterations meet historic preservation guidelines should be a suggestion, not a requirement. Since the process is already often not well received by homeowners, such a requirement may make negative reactions worse.

Commissioner Cordes stated that everyone comes into the COA process at a different level, based on their previous experiences and knowledge. Regardless of their level, the excellent city staff ushers them through the process and ends up accomplishing what associate member Oestreich suggested. Commissioner Cordes thinks the process is working well.

Ms. Doak stated that often she refers applicants to the Preservation Briefs, which are very educational. Masonry, repointing, and repair briefs are especially valuable since information on those areas is hard to find.

Commissioner McVey said that the 96% acceptance rate of COA applications suggests that homeowners understand the COA process and what is and is not allowed.

Ms. Doak feels that there was more acceptance and understanding in the past. There are many new homeowners in Highland Park who are not familiar with the process.

Commissioner Warren stated that when you buy a house, realtors are not very informative about the rules and regulations that come with the purchase of a landmarked property. He was only vaguely aware of the process required in order to make changes on his home when he bought his Highland Park house.

Commissioner Calder said that it would be nice if realtors looked at the landmark status of a property as a restrictive covenant like those common in new developments, and made buyers aware of it.

Commissioner Andich explained that when the Preservation Ordinance was new, it would show up on the abstract of a housing title search that the house is landmarked or in a historic district and is subject to the stipulations of the Ordinance. Now that the Ordinance is nearly thirty years old, title searchers do not go back far enough in order to identify that information.

Ms. Doak informed the Commission that the City still puts together informational flyers for homes that are up for sale. Commissioners should contact Jill if they see a landmark for sale and she will create a flyer with pertinent historical background and informational links, which will be given to the realtor and homeowner.

Commissioner Warren stated that it is sometimes economically impossible or impractical to completely comply with the Preservation Ordinance.

Commissioner Oestreich pointed out that there is the option of a Certificate of Economic Hardship.

Ms. Doak explained that the Certificate of Economic Hardship is not based on income; it is based on the change in the assessed value for the property for the change that is requested.

Mr. Carmen stated that there have only been a few Certificate of Economic Hardships issued.

Associate member Oestreich left the session.

Commissioner Andich moved to adjourn to the Executive Session, which was seconded by Commissioner McVey. The motion passed unanimously.

Executive Session

Chairman Braun called the Executive Session to order at 5:17 p.m. in order to consider reappointments of Jeff Dismar, Daryl Empen, and Diane Oestreich to One-Year Terms as Associate Members

Mr. Carman explained that associate members of the Commission are non-voting members that provide advice and are typically previous members of the commission.

Regular Session

Chairman Braun called to order the Regular Session at 5:20 p.m.

Chairman Braun announced the reappointment of associate members Jeff Dismer, Daryl Empen, and Diane Oestreich and the appointment of new associate member Linda Anderson.

The Commission adjourned at 5:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alan M. Carmen, Secretary
Rock Island Preservation Commission